

E-Journal of International and Comparative

LABOUR STUDIES

Volume 4, No. 1 January 2015





E-Journal of International and Comparative **LABOUR STUDIES**

ADAPT International School of Higher Education in Labour and Industrial Relations

Scientific Directors

Lauren Appelbaum (USA), Greg Bamber (Australia), Stuart M. Basefsky, (United States), Daria V. Chernyaeva (Russia), Richard Croucher (United Kingdom), Maurizio del Conte (Italy), Tomas Davulis (Lithuania), Tayo Fashoyin (Nigeria), József Hajdu (Hungary), Ann Hodges (USA), Richard Hyman (United Kingdom), Maarten Keune (The Netherlands), Chris Leggett (Australia), Guglielmo Meardi, (United Kingdom), Shinya Ouchi (Japan), Massimo Pilati (Italy), Valeria Pulignano (Belgium), Michael Quinlan (Australia), Juan Raso Delgue (Uruguay), Raúl G. Saco Barrios (Peru), Alfredo Sánchez Castaneda (Mexico), Malcolm Sargeant (United Kingdom), Jean-Michel Servais (Belgium), Silvia Spattini (Italy), Michele Tiraboschi (Italy), Anil Verma (Canada), Stephen A. Woodbury (USA)

Joint Managing Editors

Malcolm Sargeant (Middlesex University, United Kingdom) Michele Tiraboschi (University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, Italy)

Editorial Board

Lilli Casano (Italy), Francesca Fazio (Italy), Emanuele Ferragina (United Kingdom), Antonio Firinu (Italy), Valentina Franca (Slovenia), Maria Giovannone (Italy), Erica Howard (United Kingdom), Karl Koch (United Kingdom), Lefteris Kretsos (United Kingdom), Attila Kun (Hungary), Felicity Lamm (New Zealand), Cristina Lincaru (Romania), Nikita Lyutov (Russia), Merle Muda (Estonia), Boaz Munga (Kenya), John Opute (UK), Eleonora Peliza (Argentina), Daiva Petrylaite (Lithuania), Ceciel Rayer (The Netherlands), Aidan Regan (Ireland), Marian Rizov (United Kingdom), Salma Slama (Tunisia), Francesca Sperotti (Italy), Araya Mesele Welemariam (Ethiopia), Barbara Winkler (Austria), Machilu Zimba (South Africa)

Language Editor

Pietro Manzella (ADAPT Senior Research Fellow)

Book Review Editor

Chris Leggett (James Cook University, Australia)

E-Journal of International and Comparative

LABOUR STUDIES

Volume 4, No.1 January 2015



@ 2015 ADAPT University Press

Online Publication of the ADAPT Series Registration No. 1609, 11 November 2001, Court of Modena *mmn.adaptbulletin.eu*

The articles and the documents published in the *E-Journal of International and Comparative LABOUR STUDIES* are not copyrighted. The only requirement to make use of them is to cite their source, which should contain the following wording: **@ 2015 ADAPT University Press.**

Ethiopia and the Surge of Wage Labour

Samuel Andreas Admasie *

Ethiopia is currently going through a phase of rapid capitalist growth. A substantial amount of scholarship has been forthcoming on this process. Yet, preciously little has been said about one of its most deeply transformative aspects: the rapid expansion of wage labour and the social transformation this entails.

1. Trajectory of Expansion

Since the modern Ethiopian state embarked on a sustained strategy of socio-economic modernization in the aftermath of Italian occupation, much faith has been put in the ability of the modern sector to generate economic growth, technological development and socio-economic transformation away from subsistence production and – eventually – self-employment¹. Capitalist growth – whether under state or private auspices – sought by three consecutive regimes has, however, been elusive². Wage employment, as a result, has failed to reach the importance envisioned by the drafters of successive strategies for economic development³.

By the mid-1960s, in the heyday of the modernization push of the imperial regime, the modern wage employing sectors employed less than

^{*} PhD candidate and regional representative of the International Institute of Social History in Sub-Saharan Africa. I thank Elin Carlsson of Sida for kindly forwarding two recent and pertinent publications on labour issues in Ethiopia.

¹ See, for instance, Imperial Ethiopian Government (1968) and Provisional Military Government of Socialist Ethiopia (1984).

² See Eshetu (2004) for a detailed and historically grounded discussion of this.

³ Mulat, Fantu and Ferede (2006: 43-46), for instance, show the level of stagnation of employment in the manufacturing sector over the past decades, contrasting with the above cited plans.

300,000 people⁴. Outside of a temporary expansion of military personnel and layers added by unsuccessful experiments in bureaucratic management of the economy, growth rate was sluggish and as a result these numbers remained fairly stagnant throughout the rule of the *Derg⁵*. As the incoming government of the Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front liberalised the economy in the early 1990s the bloated statal sectors were trimmed down, and the trajectory reverted to one solidly dominated by household/self-employment.

Economic growth rates have been relatively high for much of the 21st century, but much of this growth has failed to fundamentally transform the structure of employment⁶. But as of recently, something substantial seems to be happening.

In the most recent National Labour Force Survey commissioned by the Central Statistical Agency, paid employment was up at a historic high of 4,253,000, which amount to just below 10 percent of the total working population⁷. This is of course a figure much lower than that of the number of people dependent on the incomes of wage labour in the country, and there are significant numbers of wage workers that remain hidden from the statistics⁸. Yet, when compared to the corresponding number of 2,478,000 in the previous survey it reveals a trajectory of rapid expansion⁹. This figure, moreover, is set to accelerate further in the near years to come. The following examples may serve to illustrate this point.

2

⁴ The sectors comprising the modern economy are listed as industrial agriculture, mining, manufacturing, construction, trade, banking and insurance, transportation, utilities, government, social services, and other services. Stutz (1967: 11-12) argues that the estimate of 294,000 given by the US Department of Labor is too low, and indeed lists non-agricultural sectors as employing 940,000 (ibid: 11). However, while the modern sectors listed in the former are such that wage employment can be assumed to account for the overwhelming majority, it is not certain that the same applies to all employees listed in the latter estimate.

 $^{^{5}}$ Derg – meaning committee – is the Amharic name by which the military-led government that ruled Ethiopia between 1974 and 1991 is usually referred to.

⁶ M. Pedro, *Structural Change in Ethiopia: An Employment Perspective*, Policy Research working paper WPS 6749, World Bank Group, Washington, DC, 2014.

¹ Central Statistical Agency, *Statistical Report on the 2013 National Labour Force Survey*, Addis Ababa, 2014, p. 266.

⁸ M. Rizzo, Rural Wage Employment in Rwanda and Ethiopia: A Review of the Current Policy Neglect and a Framework to Begin Addressing it, Working Paper 103, Policy Integration Department, International Labour Office, Geneva, 2011, p. 3-7.

⁹ Central Statistical Agency, *Statistical Report on the 2005 National Labour Force Survey*, Addis Ababa, 2006, p. 215.

Although expansion generated by Ethiopian private capital remains elusive, foreign capital – mostly from emerging economies – has began to find its way to Ethiopia's employment generating sectors. The horticultural sector - where Indian capital is dominant - was an early sign of this. Statistics on the growth trajectory are incomplete, but data from the Ethiopian Horticultural Development Agency indicates that the number of employees within the sector more than doubled to a total number of 200,000 between 2008 and 2011 alone¹⁰. The emergent shoe and leather industry, were Chinese capital is dominant, is another case in point. In one telling example, Chinese footwear giant Huajin Group is planning to develop a 'shoe-city' that is to generate employment for between 100,000 and 200,000 people at its Addis Ababa cluster¹¹, and another zone under development in Modjo, 73 kilometres south of Addis Ababa, is meant to cluster factories and tanneries that may employ up to 65,000 workers¹². Several other industrial zones are being developed with Chinese assistance to exploit the availability of cheap labour, and, among others, the potentials of nascent leather and textile industries.

While major infrastructural projects and the expansion of the civil service are set to continue to generate employment opportunities, several large statal conglomerates have recently entered the fray. The Metals and Engineering Corporation, established in 2010, is currently running no less than 75 factories, while several more are in the pipelines¹³. But the best example of the vigour with which the state is currently driving the expansion of wage employment is probably the Sugar Corporation. Although a smaller precursor had existed since the time of the *Derg*, the recently re-established corporation has embarked on a course of multifold expansion. A moderate calculation based on information from the corporation's website¹⁴ would indicate that above 250,000 people are 3

¹⁰ Ethiopian Horticulture Development Agency, *Ethiopian Horticulture Sector Statistical Bulletin* 1, Addis Ababa, 2012.

¹¹ E. Jobson, *Ethiopia Could Be Shoemaker of the World*, Business Day, April 4, 2013. <u>http://www.bdlive.co.za/africa/africanbusiness/2013/04/04/ethiopia-could-be-shoemaker-to-the-world</u> (accessed June 13, 2014).

¹² 'George Shoe takes 15,000 Unit Export Baby Steps', *Fortune* Vol. 15 No 737, June 15, 2014.

¹³ W. Davison, *Ethiopian Military-Run Corporation Seeks More Foreign Partners, Bloomberg*, February 13, 2013. <u>http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2013-02-18/ethiopian-military-run-corporation-seeks-more-foreign-partners.html</u> (accessed on June 16, 2014).

¹⁴ <u>http://www.etsugar.gov.et/en/projects.html</u> (accessed on September 16, 2014). The planned employment figures for the listed projects are Tendaho 50,000; Beles 50,199; Wolkaiyt 33,466; Kuraz 117,131 respectively. The Kessem and Arjo Dediessa projects have no employment estimates listed, but their size is lesser than the former four.

planned to be employed on sites currently under development, with 70,000 to take up employment within this budget year alone – and this figure only covers the immediate employees of the corporation. The number of people depending on wage labour is more daunting. Above 50,000 residential blocks are being constructed to house employees and family members, and this is not taking into account the employment opportunities offered by the emergence of these towns.

Meanwhile, large scale land acquisitions – concomitant enclosures and the establishment of commercial plantations – showcase both the push and pull factors of proletarianisation¹⁵.

2. Questions

The contemporary expansion of wage labour potentially constitutes the biggest transformation in Ethiopian labour and class relations since the land reform of 1975 did away with landlordism and tenancy. Yet, very little is known about the details of this process, and little research is forthcoming on its consequences.

There are indications that working conditions in at least some of the emerging sectors mentioned above remain wanting on a number of aspects¹⁶. Wages, meanwhile, are depressed¹⁷. The government boasts being able to supply some of Africa's cheapest labour¹⁸, and the ability to continue to supply cheap labour is a premise on which current industrial development efforts are based¹⁹. The ability of workers to organise freely, furthermore, is severely restricted²⁰. But beyond such obvious concerns, the picture is far from complete.

4

¹⁵ See Fouad (2014) for an excellent exposition on this process.

¹⁶ International Labour Organization, *365th Report of the Committee on Freedom of Association*, Geneve, 2012.

¹⁷ Ethiopia's current labour law includes no minimum wage provisions. A new labour law, however, is under discussion.

¹⁸ Ethiopian Investment Agency, An Investment Guide to Ethiopia: Opportunities and Conditions 2013, Addis Ababa, 2013, p. 13.

¹⁹ T. Altenburg, *Industrial Policy in Ethiopia*, Discussion Paper 2/2010, German Development Institute, 2010, p. 19; Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, *National Employment Policy and Strategy of Ethiopia*, Addis Ababa, 2009, p. 21.

²⁰ Although the right to unionize is upheld in the Ethiopian labour legislation International Labour Organization (2012: 1, 668-692), Tewodros (2010), Praeg (2006: 185-196) and Dessalegn (2002: 114) describe some manners in which this right is

A number of questions require immediate attention: What are the conditions under which the masses of new wage employees labour and how do they differ? How are these labouring masses constituted: who are they and where do they come from? How are the surpluses generated by their labour divided and appropriated? What will the surge of wage labour mean for broader social relations? How will transforming class relations affect the political configuration?

These are questions that still may be open, but their settlement holds the potential of establishing the social contours of development for the coming decades²¹. The surge of wage labour and the concomitant class relations that are emerging can no longer sustainably be ignored by the scholarly community.

References

T. Altenburg, *Industrial Policy in Ethiopia*, Discussion Paper 2/2010, German Development Institute, 2010.

R. Brenner, The Origins of Capitalist Development: A Critique of Neo-Smithian Marxism, in New Left Review, 1977, Series 1, N. 104, 25-92.

Central Statistical Agency, *Statistical Report on the 2013 National Labour Force Survey*, Addis Ababa, 2014

Central Statistical Agency, *Statistical Report on the 2005 National Labour Force Survey*, Addis Ababa, 2006.

W. Davison, *Ethiopian Military-Run Corporation Seeks More Foreign Partners, Bloomberg*, February 13, 2013. <u>http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2013-02-18/ethiopian-military-run-corporation-seeks-more-foreign-partners.html</u> (accessed on June 16, 2014).

curtailed in practice. Certain categories of state employees, furthermore, are prohibited from unionizing.

²¹ R. Brenner, *The Origins of Capitalist Development: A Critique of Neo-Smithian Marxism*, in *New Left Review*, 1977, Series 1, N. 104, 25-92.

6

Dessalegn Rahmato²², *Civil Society Organizations in Ethiopia*, in Bahru Zewde and S. Pausewang (eds.), *Ethiopia*: *The Challenge of Democracy from Below*, Nordic Africa Institute, Uppsala, 103-119.

Ethiopian Investment Agency, An Investment Guide to Ethiopia: Opportunities and Conditions 2013, Addis Ababa, 2013.

Ethiopian Horticulture Development Agency, *Ethiopian Horticulture Sector Statistical Bulletin* 1, Addis Ababa, 2012.

Eshetu Chole, Underdevelopment in Ethiopia, Organisation for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa, Addis Ababa, 2004.

Fouad Makki, Development by Dispossession: Terra Nullius and the Social-Ecology of New Enclosures in Ethiopia, in Rural Sociology, 2014, vol. 79, n. 1, 79–103.

Imperial Ethiopian Government, Third Five-Year Development Plan, Addis Ababa, 1968.

International Labour Organization, Decent Work Country Profile: Ethiopia. Addis Ababa, 2013.

International Labour Organization, 365th Report of the Committee on Freedom of Association, Geneve, 2012.

E. Jobson, *Ethiopia could be shoemaker of the world*, in Business Day, April 4, 2013.

http://www.bdlive.co.za/africa/africanbusiness/2013/04/04/ethiopiacould-be-shoemaker-to-the-world (accessed June 13, 2014).

Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, National Employment Policy and Strategy of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa, 2009.

Mulat Demeke, Fantu Guta and Tadele Ferede, *Towards a more employment-intensive and pro-poor economic growth in Ethiopia: Issues and policies*, Issues in Employment and Poverty Discussion Paper No. 22, Employment Strategy Department, International Labour Office, Geneva, 2006.

²² Ethiopian authors are usually referenced according to given name.

M. Pedro, *Structural Change in Ethiopia: An Employment Perspective*, Policy Research working paper WPS 6749, World Bank Group, Washington, DC, 2014.

Provisional Military Government of Socialist Ethiopia, Ten-Year Prospective Plan: 1984/85 - 1993/94, Addis Ababa, 1984.

B. Praeg, *Ethiopia and Political Renaissance in Africa*, Nova Science, New York, 2006.

M. Rizzo, Rural Wage Employment in Rwanda and Ethiopia: A Review of the Current Policy Neglect and a Framework to Begin Addressing it, Working Paper 103, Policy Integration Department, International Labour Office, Geneva, 2011

R. Stutz, *The Developing Industrial Relations System in Ethiopia*, Mimeo., Haile Selassie I University, 1967.

Tewodros Worku Nigatu, Promoting Workers' Right in the African Horticulture: Labour Condition in The Ethiopian Horticulture Industry, The National Federation of Farm, Plantation, Fishery & Agro-industry Trade Unions of Ethiopia/Women Working Worldwide Action Report, Addis Ababa, 2010.



By combining legal and language expertise, ADAPT LANGUAGES supplies professional translation and interpretation services in the field of labour law, industrial relations, and Human Resources Management (HRM). Our services include the following:

- translation, editing and proofreading of documentation, books, and academic papers;
- conference interpreting; language courses for businesses and stakeholders;
- linguistic assistance in international events.

Different language combinations are possible. Make contact with <u>linguelavoro@adapt.it</u> to request our services and to get a quote.

Adapt International Network



ADAPT is a non-profit organisation founded in 2000 by Prof. Marco Biagi with the aim of promoting studies and research in the field of labour law and industrial relations from an international and comparative perspective. Our purpose is to encourage and implement a new approach to academic research, by establishing relationships ongoing with other universities and advanced studies institutes, and promoting academic and scientific exchange programmes with enterprises, institutions, foundations and associations. In collaboration with the Centre for International and Comparative Studies on Law, Economics, Environment and Work, (DEAL) the Marco Biagi Department of Economics, University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, ADAPT set up the International School of Higher Education in Labour and Industrial Relations, a centre of excellence which is accredited at an international level for research, study and postgraduate programmes in the area of industrial and labour relations. Further information at *www.adapt.it*.

For more information about the E-journal and to submit a paper, please send a mail to *LS@adapt.it*.



THE MARCO BIAGI DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS UNIVERSITY OF MODENA AND REGGIO EMILIA

